EDUCATION MONITORING REPORT 2012
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
EDUCATION MONITORING REPORT
2012
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
Education Reform Initiative (ERI), was established in 2003 at Sabancı University with the aim of improving education policy and decision-making through research, advocacy and training.

ERI also attempts to serve as an example as to how policy dialogue should be conducted within a contemporary democratic framework by bringing together concerned civil society groups and relevant state agencies to catalyze an innovative collective thought process for education reform policy.

ERI is currently supported by Mother Child Education Foundation, Aydın Doğan Foundation, Bahçeşehir University, Borusan Kocabıyık Foundation, Elginkan Foundation, Enerji-Su, ENKA Foundation, İstanbul Bilgi University, İstanbul Kültür University, Kadir Has Foundation, Mehmet Zorlu Foundation, Murat Vargı Holding, Nafi Güral Education Foundation, Sabancı University, The Marmara Hotels & Residences, Association of All Private Education Institutions, Vodafone Turkey Foundation, Vehbi Koç Foundation and Yapı Merkezi.

The executive summary of this report has been translated into English with financial contributions from Turkish Philanthropy Funds.

September 2013

Copyright Sabancı University.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Education Reform Initiative (ERI) continues to present a consistent, comprehensive, and critical evaluation of the education policies and their implementation through its annual Education Monitoring Reports. Education Monitoring Report 2012 is the sixth of these, and in accordance with previous reports, it evaluates the main developments in Turkey’s education system under four main components (students, teachers and learning processes, content of education, and learning environments), as well as in terms of governance and financing. Moreover, the chapter on educational outcomes, which was first introduced in the 2010 report, has been enriched with more analytical content.

The predominant topic of this year’s report is the possible impact of the regulations regarding Law No. 6287, the legislation commonly known as “4+4+4,” on education. Among other topics addressed in the report are financing of education; attendance in pre-school education; developments in special education; an analysis of teacher supply and demand; the FATİH (Movement to Enhance Opportunities and Improve Technology) Project whose implementation gained momentum in 2012; changes in weekly course schedules; curriculum and materials; and a review of the newly introduced elective courses. The report finally presents an analysis of Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) results.

Education Monitoring Report 2012 is the outcome of various information gathering and sharing processes. As well as visits, observations and assessments conducted by ERI throughout the year; the data provided by MoNE and other institutions in the Journal of Announcements (Tebliğler Dergisi) have been examined within the context of the questions raised in the report. Additionally, three background reports have been prepared by experts from outside ERI: Prof. Sinan Olkun studied the curricula and course materials for the Mathematical Applications course; Mine Yıldırım evaluated the new elective religious courses in terms of human rights standards; Assoc. Prof. Tülin Güler and researcher Mefharet Veziroğlu examined the curricula and course materials in transition to primary education. Apart from these, a background report that addresses the state of education in Van after the 2011 earthquakes was penned by the organization Gündem: Çocuk! at the end of 2012.

In order to obtain information regarding the preparation and implementation of the projects that were put into effect by MoNE in 2012, project executives from the Ministry were interviewed and focus group discussions were held with school principals and teachers. Finally, with the consultation meetings ERI held in Istanbul and Ankara where the draft report was brought up for discussion with the attendance of relevant stakeholders, the report’s feedback process was finalized with verbal and written comments of stakeholders.

The enactment of the “4+4+4” bill has been a step backwards in terms of design and implementation of educational policy in Turkey. However, the available data is still not sufficient for an overall assessment of the impact of the new bill.

MoNE’s increasing tendency to conduct education policy decision making through a data-driven and participatory process was emphasized in previous issues of the Education Monitoring Report. ERI has already stated in various media outlets that the strategic plan approach introduced...
with the Law No. 5108 on Public Financial Management and Control, as well as the more recent Decree Law No. 652 on the Organization and Duties of the Ministry of National Education provide substantial opportunity for the education system. There is no question that Law 6287, publicly known as “4+4+4,” published in the Official Gazette and initiated on April 11, 2011, is legitimate within the current legal system. However, some discrepancies exist between its enactment process and the government’s efforts to improve public administration as per MoNE’s aforementioned constructive tendency. The process did not comply with the principles of democratic governance. It would be correct to say that the bill was submitted to the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (GNAT) without thorough and sufficient public discussion. It can be observed that the bill’s legislative content has not been based on actual data and are thus devoid of rational context. The legislation overlooks the fact that education is a complex system comprising several components, and therefore lacks coherence in design and strategy. There is also the fact that only a few NGOs were consulted for their views during the drafting stage of the bill.

In response to the reactions following the bill’s submission to GNAT, the National Education, Culture, Youth and Sports Committee decided to set up a sub-committee and hear the views of a broader range of NGOs, universities and unions. The forming of this sub-committee, as well as the fact that some of the warnings made during the meetings were indeed taken into consideration, were positive steps in terms of state-NGO cooperation. However, the time constraints on the legislative process did not allow for the discussions to take place on a sound basis or with broad participation.

Furthermore, taking into consideration the scope of the change introduced with “4+4+4,” GNAT did not provide MoNE with sufficient time and guidance to duly apply the law regarding the needs of each school, teacher and student. Reflecting on the picture after a year, it can be claimed that administrators of cities, towns and schools, particularly on the local level, have managed to prevent dramatic declines in the average education indicators through their own extraordinary efforts. Disadvantaged schools, on the other hand, were more affected by the change. The impact of the law is being assessed on the basis of the data attained in Education Monitoring Report 2012.

One of the most significant messages that may be deduced from the Education Monitoring Report 2012 is that improving the quality of education and reducing inequality do not seem to hold the same importance for policy makers as much as increasing student access to education does.

Extending compulsory education may, in the long term, provide more students with the chance of enrolling in secondary education. However, unless the quality of education improves what and how these students learn, their ability to rationally interpret what they have learned and the extent to which they will be able to apply their knowledge to real life situations are bound to remain controversial. One of the important findings of the Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) 2011 is that nearly a quarter of both 4th and 8th grade students in Turkey do not possess even the most basic proficiency in math and science. This is a clear indication of lack of quality. Therefore, the efforts directed at increasing access to education must be complemented with an improvement in the quality of national education, taking regional differences into consideration.

The law “4+4+4” has brought along a series of structural changes in primary education and changes aimed at increasing access to secondary education. In addition to these, significant
Changes to education governance were also made in the year 2012. The two most noteworthy changes were the restructuring of the central organization of MoNE and the abolishment of provincial special administrations in 30 cities pursuant to the new Law on Metropolitan Municipalities.

While the country’s educational agenda and MoNE were occupied with all these changes and new practices, important projects aiming to improve the quality of education planned in previous years suffered setbacks. One of these initiatives is the School Based Professional Development (SBPD) project, defined as a set of processes supporting teachers’ professional knowledge, skills, values and attitudes both within and outside school, as well as assisting teachers in forming effective teaching and learning environments. Another is the determination of teacher competencies in connection with the SBPD project. The National Teacher Strategy is yet another project expected to offer advanced insight regarding teachers’ specializations and working conditions; as well as initiatives regarding early childhood education quality. If these projects were implemented as planned, they would likely trigger an improvement in the quality of education, whereas a further delay in these initiatives would only be to Turkey’s detriment.

Reflecting back on 2012 from the aspect of educational financing, it can be observed that real public expenditures on education still follow an upward trend.

The ratio of public expenditures on education to GDP rose to 4.2% in 2012 and the Ministry of Finance has planned to increase this ratio in the following years.
Although the increase in education expenditures is a positive development, *Education Monitoring Report* 2012 finds that this increase is not sufficient to meet the demands arising from “4+4+4.” Making secondary education compulsory and going ahead with a comprehensive restructuring in primary education as per “4+4+4,” while at the same time maintaining efforts to increase preschool education as proposed by MoNE, would require a substantial increase in public expenditures on education. Hence there are doubts regarding whether the increase in expenditures on education through public funding meets the increase required for “4+4+4.”

One of the fundamental changes introduced with “4+4+4” is the lower age to start primary education. Under the new legislation, as of academic year 2012-2013, it is compulsory for 66 month olds to start primary school; while 60-66 month olds will be considered eligible to enroll upon request of their parents.

No significant change was observed in the schooling rates of 36-72 and 48-72 month age groups in the academic year 2012-2013. The schooling rate of the 5 year old age group, on the other hand, went up from last year’s 65.7 % to 74 %, which is a noteworthy increase. Yet, only 41 % of the children in this age group enrolled in preschool education; while 32 % who could have attended preschool education in the old system enrolled in primary education, instead. In other words, compared to the previous year, there has been a decline in the pre-schooling rate of 5 year olds.

Another important development was that 48 % of children born in 2007, thus classified in the pre-schooling age under “4+4+4,” enrolled in preschool education; while 14 % of them enrolled in primary education. In other words, 14 % started primary education early upon the request of their parent or guardian. The remaining unschooled 38 %, on the other hand, will have to enroll during the next academic year, without having received preschool education.
Lastly, under “4+4+4,” even if students have reached the age of compulsory enrolment for primary education, they can postpone their enrolment for a year if they provide a medical report from the Ministry of Health documenting that they are not ready for school. As a matter of fact, the data suggest that 70,861 out of 326,740 (22%) 5 year olds who are now considered old enough to enroll in primary education have obtained such reports, which means that a considerable number of students postponed enrolment in primary education.

There was only a slight increase in the number of students in special education in 2012-2013. As in previous years, the number of students who receive inclusive education declined dramatically in the transition from primary to secondary education.

The fact that the gap remains between primary and secondary school attendance rates of special-needs students, even after secondary education was made compulsory under “4+4+4,” indicates that (i) making a certain level of education mandatory does not necessarily ensure 100...
% attendance and (ii) different mechanisms need to be put in place to increase the enrolment of special-needs kids in secondary education. The most significant steps to be taken are those that will raise the general level of quality in special education through the improvement of teacher and curricula competencies.

The net primary schooling rate was recorded as 98.67% for the academic year 2011-2012 and as 98.80% for 2012-2013. Since MoNE’s data on absenteeism and dropout rates is not available, delivering a comprehensive assessment regarding attendance to education on these levels has not been possible.

The schooling rate did not differ much by gender and was quite similar to that recorded in the previous year. On the other hand, with the division of primary education into two four-year stages, the problem of access encountered at the middle school level has become more apparent. While the net primary schooling rate was recorded as 98.86%, the rate for middle school reads 93.09%. Even though this level has been mandatory for the last 15 years, the fact that access is still limited points to a fundamental problem requiring immediate attention. In addition to these, schooling rates differ considerably across cities and regions on both levels, the discrepancy being much more profound and widespread in middle school.

Contrary to expectations, extending compulsory education to include the secondary level under “4+4+4” has not set off a noteworthy increase in schooling.

Attendance rates for secondary education differ greatly by province and gender, while the lowest schooling rates for the academic year 2012-2013 were recorded in the eastern cities of Turkey such as Ağrı, Bitlis, Muş, Şanlıurfa and Van. The breakdown by gender for secondary education differs from province to province and the gap between schooling rates of boys and girls is wider, particularly in
The Project on Developing Projections, Strategies and Systems for Teacher Employment (IKOP) was an important step taken in 2012 offering potential to correct deficiencies in teacher employment policies to a certain extent.

The project assumes, by design, a comprehensive perspective for teacher employment policies. The project findings indicate that approximately 200,000 teachers will be employed in the upcoming period. These estimations hold great importance for policy makers, since they clearly reveal the drastic discrepancy between high teacher supply and low demand (students and graduates of the faculties of education). The project team stresses the need to lower the admittance quotas in education faculties in accordance with teacher employment projections in order to promptly do away with this discrepancy. IKOP’s other key feature for strategic planning is the medium and long-term design of its project deliverables. The project design was supported by data and evidence-based studies conducted by the project team and the findings of the project have been made available for the direct use of policy makers and implementers. As such, IKOP’s implementation is highly likely to contribute to a more fruitful use of Turkey’s human resources in general.

School-age populations are the basic determinants IKOP uses for teacher demand. As the number of teachers required for employment is directly related to the number of students within the education system, school-age populations are without a doubt of key importance for the planning phase of teacher employment policies. However, when the net increase in the number of teachers between the academic years 1998-1999 and 2011-2012 is examined, it is observed that the total number of teachers seems to be determined, not so much by school-age populations, but rather by the timing of general and local elections.

**Figure 4: Number of students enrolled in pre-university education and net yearly increase in the number of teachers (1998-2011)**

Source: TÜİK, http://www.tuik.gov.tr; ERI’s estimations
Advances regarding teacher demand and supply need to be made in various areas outside of IKOP, as well. Foremost among these are setting new regulations and/or institutions that will strengthen the coordination between MoNE and the Higher Education Council (HEC), eliminating the link between teacher employment and election cycles, as well as reviewing regulations regarding teacher appointments and transfers.

Furthermore, promoting quality in-service training and making it more widespread would be an essential policy choice in order to improve teacher quality. Supporting teachers in Turkey by providing them with quality in-service training carries immense importance, since teachers, especially those who start their careers in public schools, are expected to spend their professional lives within the educational system. No significant steps were taken in 2012 in areas that may enhance teacher quality, such as accreditation of faculties of education, strengthening collaboration between faculties of education and schools, putting more emphasis on teaching practice in faculties of education, and increasing faculties’ say in determining their curricula.

As the education system underwent a radical transformation during the academic year 2012-2013, many new developments came along regarding the curricular content.

With the enforcement of the “4+4+4” legislation, weekly course schedules for institutions of primary and secondary education were revised. Students in lower secondary and secondary education have been offered a widened pool of elective courses. In line with the newly added elective courses and the updated schedules, a number of changes in curricula and related teaching materials have been developed.

The revisions made in primary school curricula mark a positive step in the right direction. However, there is still a long way to go. The increase in the number of elective courses in secondary education has a significant effect on the total weekly hours on students’ schedules. Weekly course hours for students enrolled in general high schools, vocational high schools and technical high schools went up from 30 to 37; while in Anatolian, science, social sciences, Anatolian teacher, fine arts and sports high schools, this number reached 40 hours. What needs to be emphasized here is that, it is not possible to achieve an actual transformation in the education system by a mere change in the number of course hours. The duration of time in a subject-matter area will only have a positive effect on the quality of the education when it is reinforced with well-developed curricula, well-equipped environments and teachers. Therefore, there is still a need to set the necessary regulations in these areas. Furthermore, the extent to which the schedule changes will affect learning and teaching processes can only be observed in the long term. The possible effects of these efforts shall nevertheless be observed and evaluated.

In the academic year 2012-2013 some problems were experienced in schools during the decision phase of the elective courses and curricula. The information provided to students regarding the courses and the time given to make a decision proved insufficient. Schools therefore had difficulty, due to both time and space limitations, with fitting the new elective courses in the schedules. Course schedules and materials for several of the elective courses introduced this year were developed in a short time, without allowing for a preliminary preparation phase, or a pilot scheme for teachers. Therefore, elective course schedules, materials and course selection processes could be improved in light of student and teacher experiences during the academic year 2012-2013.
A striking highlight from 2012 was that it became compulsory for 66-80 month olds to enroll in primary school. After the mandatory age to start school was lowered, the schedule for the “Orientation and Preparation” program for the academic year 2012-2013 covering the first 12 weeks of the 1st grade, as well as the related student and teacher books were published on MoNE’s web-site. However, first grade teachers teaching 66-80 month olds for the first time were not offered sufficient training or orientation. The arrival of the programs and materials were delayed. Such shortcomings and obstacles may have disrupted the intended implementation of the program.

The structures and trends observed in the 2012-2013 academic year in terms of the breakdown of primary and secondary education students are quite similar to those of past years. General high schools are still in the process of being either turned into Anatolian high schools or transferred to vocational or technical secondary education. As a result of this process, the share of general high schools in secondary education is still in decline. The steady rise in the rate of students attending imam-hatip schools (religious high schools) continues.

The breakdown by gender, on the other hand, has revealed a more significant increase in the rate of female students enrolled in imam-hatip high schools. While the share of students in vocational and technical secondary education showed no increase in 2012-2013, the number of vocational and technical high schools was on the rise. Finally, as a result of the incentives offered to private
vocational and technical high schools, there has been a substantial increase in the number of such schools compared to previous years.

Detailed observation and assessment on the effects of all the changes holds key importance in the upcoming period. These assessments would reveal what sort of effect the enacted changes have on students. Close monitoring and evaluation of these initial experiences would be crucial for the improvement of the newly developed curricula and materials, as well as for the development of new policies.

The work on content and teacher training conducted for the FATİH (The Movement to Enhance Opportunities and Improve Technology) Project still seems to be falling short; nevertheless there have been intense efforts toward improving curricular content.

It was announced by MoNE that the 2013 budget for the FATİH Project is 1.4 billion TL. This amount corresponds to 3% of MoNE’s general budget for 2013. Despite the large amount of public funds, the details of how it will be allocated among the components of the project have not yet been made public.

It can be said that great importance has been attached to the content in this project. However, the fact that the content aspect was not carefully planned prior to implementation and that the different aspects were not implemented simultaneously, remain important concerns. Tablet computers and interactive boards without the necessary content will have limited or no contribution to learning. Attempting to develop content in the preliminary phase of the project without considering that it is a lengthy process subject to various approval mechanisms under MoNE may weaken the likelihood of the project achieving its objectives.

The fact that teacher training has been emphasized since the beginning of the project is a positive development. Unless teachers ensure the effective utilization of content and equipment within the classroom, it is quite apparent that the returns of this investment will remain limited. However, there is no clear information shared with the public regarding the method, quality or an assessment of the training given at UZEMs (Distance Learning Centers), which were founded as teacher training facilities in 2012. School visits to assess the trainings would be useful. The most significant outcome to be measured here is how well and effectively the training is applied in the classroom.

Due to the lowered compulsory age to start school, many questions have been raised regarding the anticipated increase in the number of students, and the problems with the physical capacity of schools.

The number of private and public pre-schools, pre-school school students, teachers and classrooms continued to rise in 2012-2013. Looking at nursery classes within primary schools, on the other hand, it can be seen that the lower mandatory age to start school led to a decrease in the population of students of this age group (60-72 months old), who would normally be attending nursery class. The number of nursery classes, students and classrooms which were on the rise in the academic year 2011-2012, reversed course and started to decline as of the year 2012-2013. The most probable reason behind this is the fact that some of the students in this age group enrolled in primary school instead of attending pre-school.
On the primary education level (primary and middle schools), nearly 14,000 new schools were opened in Turkey in the academic year 2012-2013, which means 15,000 more classrooms and 36,000 more teachers compared to the previous year. The course of this increase was more rapid than the previous year. Particularly the rate of increase of classrooms, which was 1.5% between the years 2011 and 2012, reached 4.5% between 2012 and 2013.

The findings of the Education Monitoring Report suggest that in some schools facilities such as the library, laboratories, teachers’ room, principal’s room, multi-purpose halls and storage rooms have been turned into classrooms.

Another unresolved issue is classroom shortages. After the younger 5 year old age group started attending primary school, many of the schools responded by placing the new 5 year olds all in one class. The underlying reason was the observation that these students were not ready for an education at the primary school level and that having 5, 6 and 7 year olds study together led to negative consequences in terms of motivation, classroom order and learning.

Furthermore, it seems that the addition of new elective courses to the curricula of secondary education further aggravated the classroom shortage initially caused by the increase in the number of students. This was the reason stated for some of the facility conversions that schools resorted to. The problem here has not been limited to shortage of classrooms, but led to a negative impact on teacher performance, and the starting and ending times of lessons. In some schools that teach their students in two shifts, i.e. dual education, in addition to lessons starting very early in the morning and finishing late in the evening, the significant increase in the total hours left the students weary and teachers incompetent. MoNE has not provided data on the number of schools offering dual education in the academic year 2012-2013. According to ERI’s calculations, however, 45.2% of all primary and middle schools, and 18.8% of all secondary level institutions provided dual education in the academic year 2012-2013.

Another finding indicates that classrooms in private primary, middle and high schools have much less crowded classrooms compared to public schools. The same applies to imam-hatip schools at the secondary level. This, in turn, suggests that teaching and learning are likely to be more efficient in private schools and imam-hatip high schools.

The results of the TIMSS exam demonstrate that students in Turkey tend to either over- or under-achieve. This clustering at the two ends indicates that inequality is an acute problem in the Turkish education system.

TIMSS is an international assessment of the mathematics and science knowledge of 4th and 8th grade students around the world, based on comprehensive information about the learning environment in each country, school and classroom. Although Turkey’s recent performance in the assessment shows some improvement compared to previous years, it still ranks below 500, which is the TIMSS scale average determined for math and science, for both 4th and 8th graders. However, referring to points and ranking alone as an assessment method does not provide much insight into the content of education and the quality of learning. What is most important about these results is that Turkey’s students tend to lie on either end of the competency distribution, either at or above the advanced level or below basic competencies. While Turkey’s performance meets or exceeds the international average in advanced achievement, the percentage of students whose achievement is below the low benchmark is much higher than the international average.
An encouraging home or family environment, as well as a student’s level of enthusiasm for the subject are among the important factors determining success at school.

Mother’s education is also observed to be directly proportional to the student’s score, particularly for female students. For a female student, the higher her mother’s level of education is, the more likely her performance will increase. This finding may guide policy makers whose objective is to ensure that female students enroll and perform well in school.

Source: Authors using TIMSS’s school survey of 2011.

![Figure 6: Correlation Between Mothers’ Level of Education and Student Success](image-url)
The fact that socioeconomic disadvantage returns to students in the form of failure is detrimental to development policy and the future of youth.

The relationship between students from low income families (disadvantaged students) and low success levels reveals, in both subjects, that the success level of students is much lower in schools where the disadvantaged constitute more than half the school population, compared to schools with a smaller population of disadvantaged students. This may result from the fact that the necessary measures in teaching, financing and infrastructure have not been implemented effectively in schools with disadvantaged students. In any case, it is clear that some concrete steps need to be taken in order to improve the success rates of these schools.

Student success may also be linked to the resources available in schools. As demonstrated in the table below, a shortage of course materials, problems with the school infrastructure and deficiencies in instruction space have a negative effect on teaching in most schools included in the sample. The lack of resources in these schools, where mostly disadvantaged students are enrolled, doesn’t allow a healthy learning environment for students who are already behind socioeconomically.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 2: SCHOOL PRINCIPALS’ VIEWS ON THE EFFECT OF LACK OF MATERIALS AND ISSUES WITH PHYSICAL FEATURES ON TEACHING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>4TH GRADE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NONE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VERY LITTLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LITTLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8TH GRADE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NONE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VERY LITTLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LITTLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUCH</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ERI (using TIMSS’s school survey of 2011).

Keeping track of the results of assessments like TIMSS that have a high level of international validity and making use of their broad datasets is crucial for countries like Turkey who face structural challenges in education and are attempting to find concrete solutions. We hope that the findings presented in this report will be beneficial for both scholars and policy makers, and play a constructive role in shaping education policy.
EDUCATION MONITORING REPORT 2012
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY